

*Statistical Eng. Lab*

# NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS REPORT

1473

A THEOREM ON CONVEX CONES WITH APPLICATIONS  
TO LINEAR INEQUALITIES

by

Jerry W. Gaddum

National Bureau of Standards, Los Angeles, California



U. S. DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS



## THE NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS

The scope of activities of the National Bureau of Standards is suggested in the following listing of the divisions and sections engaged in technical work. In general, each section is engaged in specialized research, development, and engineering in the field indicated by its title. A brief description of the activities, and of the resultant reports and publications, appears on the inside of the back cover of this report.

1. **ELECTRICITY.** Resistance Measurements. Inductance and Capacitance. Electrical Instruments. Magnetic Measurements. Electrochemistry.
2. **OPTICS AND METROLOGY.** Photometry and Colorimetry. Optical Instruments. Photographic Technology. Length. Gage.
3. **HEAT AND POWER.** Temperature Measurements. Thermodynamics. Cryogenics. Engines and Lubrication. Engine Fuels.
4. **ATOMIC AND RADIATION PHYSICS.** Spectroscopy. Radiometry. Mass Spectrometry. Physical Electronics. Electron Physics. Atomic Physics. Neutron Measurements. Nuclear Physics. Radioactivity. X-Rays. Betatron. Nucleonic Instrumentation. Radiological Equipment. Atomic Energy Commission Instruments Branch.
5. **CHEMISTRY.** Organic Coatings. Surface Chemistry. Organic Chemistry. Analytical Chemistry. Inorganic Chemistry. Electrodeposition. Gas Chemistry. Physical Chemistry. Thermochemistry. Spectrochemistry. Pure Substances.
6. **MECHANICS.** Sound. Mechanical Instruments. Aerodynamics. Engineering Mechanics. Hydraulics. Mass. Capacity, Density, and Fluid Meters.
7. **ORGANIC AND FIBROUS MATERIALS.** Rubber. Textiles. Paper. Leather. Testing and Specifications. Organic Plastics. Dental Research.
8. **METALLURGY.** Thermal Metallurgy. Chemical Metallurgy. Mechanical Metallurgy. Corrosion.
9. **MINERAL PRODUCTS.** Porcelain and Pottery. Glass. Refractories. Enameled Metals. Building Stone. Concreting Materials. Constitution and Microstructure. Chemistry of Mineral Products.
10. **BUILDING TECHNOLOGY.** Structural Engineering. Fire Protection. Heating and Air Conditioning. Exterior and Interior Coverings. Codes and Specifications.
11. **APPLIED MATHEMATICS.** Numerical Analysis. Computation. Statistical Engineering. Machine Development.
12. **ELECTRONICS.** Engineering Electronics. Electron Tubes. Electronic Computers. Electronic Instrumentation.
13. **ORDNANCE DEVELOPMENT.** Mechanical Research and Development. Electromechanical Fuzes. Technical Services. Missile Fuzing Research. Missile Fuzing Development. Projectile Fuzes. Ordnance Components. Ordnance Tests. Ordnance Research.
14. **RADIO PROPAGATION.** Upper Atmosphere Research. Ionospheric Research. Regular Propagation Services. Frequency Utilization Research. Tropospheric Propagation Research. High Frequency Standards. Microwave Standards.
15. **MISSILE DEVELOPMENT.** Missile Engineering. Missile Dynamics. Missile Intelligence. Missile Instrumentation. Technical Services. Combustion.

**NBS PROJECT**

1101-21-5102

February 11, 1952

**NBS REPORT**

1473

A THEOREM ON CONVEX CONES WITH APPLICATIONS  
TO LINEAR INEQUALITIES\*

by

Jerry W. Gaddum

National Bureau of Standards, Los Angeles, California



PREPRINT

\*The preparation of this paper was sponsored (in part) by the Office of Scientific Research, USAF.

This report is issued for  
in any form, either in whole  
from the Office of the Director

Approved for public release by the  
Director of the National Institute of  
Standards and Technology (NIST)  
on October 9, 2015

reprinting, or reproduction  
in writing is obtained  
from NIST, Washington 25, D. C.



A Theorem on Convex Cones with Applications  
to Linear Inequalities\*

by

Jerry W. Gaddum

National Bureau of Standards, Los Angeles, California

1. INTRODUCTION

This note is concerned with the convex cone associated with the two systems of linear inequalities

$$(1) \sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j \geq 0, \quad i = 1, 2, \dots, m, \text{ and}$$

$$(2) \sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij} x_j \leq 0, \quad i = 1, 2, \dots, m, \text{ where the symbol } \geq$$

demands that the inequality ( $>$ ) hold for at least one value of  $i$ . For brevity these systems will be written (1)  $Ax \geq 0$  and (2)  $Ax \leq 0$ .

Interpreting  $(a_{i1}, \dots, a_{in})$  as a vector  $a_i$  in  $E_n$ , with initial point at the origin, we denote by  $A$  the convex cone generated by these  $m$  vectors and by  $A^*$  the polar cone, the vectors of which give the solutions of (1). A cone will be considered null if it contains only  $(0, 0, \dots, 0)$ .

The purpose of this paper is to show that in general  $A \cdot A^* \neq 0$  and to characterize the cases in which  $A$  and  $A^*$  do not intersect. Some applications are then made to obtain theorems on the existence

---

\*The preparation of this paper was sponsored (in part) by the Office of Scientific Research, USAF.



of, and methods of obtaining, solutions of (1) and (2).

## II. THE MAIN THEOREM

Before proving the main theorem, it should be remarked that the proof given does not require that the cone  $A$  be generated by finitely many vectors but the applications to be made do require this. The theorem, of which a special case has been stated in [2]<sup>1</sup>, can be formulated as follows:

Theorem 2.1. If  $A^*$  is non-null and if some vector of  $A$  is not perpendicular to all the vectors of  $A^*$ , then  $A \cdot A^* \neq 0$ .

Proof. Let  $x$  be a vector of  $A$  which is not perpendicular to all the vectors of  $A^*$ . If  $x$  is not in  $A^*$  (otherwise the theorem holds immediately) let  $y$  be that vector of  $A^*$ , of unit length, closest to  $x$ . In other words, among the unit vectors of  $A^*$ ,  $y$  makes the inner product  $x \cdot y$  a maximum. In the hyperplane orthogonal to  $y$  let  $u$  be the unit vector farthest from  $x$ , that is, minimizing  $x \cdot u$ .

Now  $u$  is a vector of  $A$ . This follows since it is a vector of the polar cone of  $A^*$  and since  $(A^*)^* = A$ . To see that  $u$  is in  $(A^*)^*$  we remark that if  $A^*$  contained a vector  $z$  making an obtuse angle with  $u$ , the plane containing  $y$  and  $z$  would contain a unit vector of  $A^*$  closer to  $x$  than  $y$ .

Letting  $\gamma = \frac{1}{x \cdot y}$ , the vector  $y - \gamma x$  is orthogonal to  $y$ , since  $y$  is a unit vector. Among the unit vectors orthogonal to  $y$ ,  $u$

---

<sup>1</sup>Numbers in brackets refer to the bibliography.





minimizes  $x \cdot u$  and hence maximizes  $y - \lambda x$ . Thus  $y - \lambda x$  has the same direction as  $u$ , and  $y - \lambda x = ku$ ,  $k > 0$ .

Then  $y = \lambda x + ku$ ,  $\lambda$  and  $k$  both positive, and  $y$  is a vector in  $A \cdot A^*$ .

If  $A$  is not contained in an  $E_{n-1}$ , the conditions of the theorem are satisfied unless  $A^*$  is null. If  $A$  is contained irreducibly in an  $E_r$ ,  $r < n$ , and  $A \cdot A^* = 0$ , then  $A$  is equal to the  $E_r$ , since no vector of  $A^*$  lies in the  $E_r$ . Thus we can characterize those cones with  $A \cdot A^* = 0$  as follows:

Theorem 2.2.  $A \cdot A^* = 0$  if and only if  $A$  is an  $E_r$  and  $A^*$  an orthogonal  $E_{n-r}$ .

### III. SOME EXISTENCE THEOREMS

In this section the foregoing discussion is applied to obtain theorems on the existence of solutions for a system of linear inequalities. A vector  $y$  is called positive if  $y_i > 0$  for each  $i$ , non-negative if  $y_i \geq 0$  for each  $i$  and  $y_i > 0$  for some  $i$ .

Theorem 3.1. The system (2) has a solution if and only if  
 $A \cdot A^* \neq 0$ .

The proof being immediate from Theorem 2.2, we state the same result algebraically.

Corollary: If (2) has a solution it has one of the form  
 $x = A'y$ , where  $y$  is non-negative and  $A'$  is the transpose of the  
matrix  $A$ .

Theorem 3.2. In order that (2) have a solution, it is necessary  
and sufficient that the system  $AA'y \geq 0$  have a non-negative solution.



Proof: First, if  $AA'y \geq 0$  has any solution at all, the relation  $x = A'y$  gives a solution of  $Ax \geq 0$ . On the other hand, if  $Ax \geq 0$  has a solution, the corollary to Theorem 3.1 states that it has one of the form  $x = A'y$ ,  $y$  non-negative, and this  $y$  is a solution of  $AA'y \geq 0$ .

It should be observed that this theorem is a strengthening of the result, in [1], that  $Ax \geq 0$  and  $AA'y \geq 0$  are either both consistent or both inconsistent.

Corollary: If B is a symmetric positive semi-definite matrix,  $By \geq 0$  has a solution if and only if it has a non-negative one.

Corollary: A sufficient condition that (1) have a solution is that  $AA'y \geq 0$  have a (non-negative) solution.

Corollary: If the rank of A is n, a necessary condition that (1) have a non-trivial solution is that  $AA'y \geq 0$  have a (non-negative) solution.

In [3] a necessary and sufficient condition is given that a system of type (2) be solvable. Using Theorem 2 of [3] we can state the following theorem.

Theorem 3.3.  $AA'y \geq 0$  (and hence (2)) has a solution if and only if  $AA'y = 0$  has no positive solution.

In [4] a method is given for determining whether or not a system of homogeneous linear equations has a positive solution. In the form given, however, the method does not seem feasible for purposes of computation.

An obvious necessary condition that  $AA'y = 0$  have a positive solution is that for any collection of rows of  $AA'$ , the  $m$  column



sums be all zero or have a pair of terms of opposite sign. Hence a sufficient condition that  $AA'y \geq 0$  (and hence (2)) have a solution is that for some collection of rows of  $AA'$ , the  $m$  column sums form a non-negative set.

Still another form can be given to the problem of determining whether or not  $AA'y \geq 0$  is solvable. Let us write  $AA' = B = (b_{ij})$  and denote the rank of  $B$  by  $r$ . We can suppose that the  $r$ -th order principal minor  $R$ , in the upper left-hand corner, is non-singular and, for the purpose of solving  $By = 0$ , we can assume its determinant positive. For  $1 \leq j \leq r$  and  $r+1 \leq k \leq m$ , let  $\beta_{jk}$  denote the negative of the determinant of the matrix obtained from  $R$  by substituting the first  $r$  elements of the  $k$ -th column of  $B$  for the  $j$ -th column of  $R$ . If we assign values arbitrarily to  $y_{r+1}, \dots, y_m$  and solve  $By = 0$  for  $y_1, \dots, y_r$ , we obtain, for  $j = 1, 2, \dots, r$ ,  $y_j = \frac{1}{|R|} [\beta_{jr+1} y_{r+1} + \dots + \beta_{jm} y_m]$ . Thus the problem reduces to that of finding positive solutions of the system:

$$\begin{aligned} & \beta_{lr+1} y_{r+1} + \dots + \beta_{lm} y_m > 0 \\ & \cdot \\ & \cdot \\ & \beta_{rr+1} y_{r+1} + \dots + \beta_{rm} y_m > 0 \end{aligned}$$

In Theorem D5, p. 50, of [5], a criterion for the existence of positive solutions of this system is given.

#### IV. COMPUTATION OF SOLUTIONS

Theorem 2.1 suggests a method for computing a solution of a system of inequalities, assuming a solution exists. We begin by normalizing the rows of the matrix  $A$ , that is, by making



$\sum_{j=1}^n a_{ij}^2 = 1$  for each  $i$ . We then simply generate a set of unit

vectors dense in the set of unit vectors of  $A$ , and hence come arbitrarily close to some vector of  $A \cdot A^*$ , if  $A \cdot A^* \neq 0$ . This can be done by adjoining to the vectors corresponding to the rows of  $A$  the mid-vector of each pair. If no solutions are obtained at the first step, continue the process on the larger set of vectors. The normalized midvector of the vectors  $a$  and  $b$  has for its  $k$ -th component  $(a_k + b_k)/\sqrt{2(1+a \cdot b)}$ . The computation of one midpoint presents no problem but the number of such computations becomes very large as we repeat the process. It would therefore be of considerable value to know how to find only essential midpoints.

February 14, 1952





BIBLIOGRAPHY

- [1] S. Agmon, The Relaxation Method for Linear Inequalities. Prepublication Copy. National Bureau of Standards, Los Angeles, California.
- [2] L. M. Blumenthal, Metric Methods in Linear Inequalities. Duke Mathematical Journal, vol. 15 (1948) pp. 955-966.
- [3] L. L. Dines, Note on Certain Associated Systems of Linear Equalities and Inequalities. Annals of Mathematics, Second Series, vol. 28(1926-27) pp. 41-42.
- [4] L. L. Dines, On Positive Solutions of a System of Linear Equations. Annals of Mathematics, Second Series, vol. 28 (1926-27) pp. 386-392.
- [5] T. S. Motzkin, Beitrage Zur Theorie der Linearen Ungleichungen. Jerusalem, 1936.

